The academic program review process assesses the overall health of instructional programs; examines the gaps between the actual performance on key indicators and the benchmarks for each; develops strategies to address program performance measures that fall short of the established benchmarks; and documents the review processes over time in order to track progress. The process is becoming increasingly more faculty driven.

Presentation of Data

Data in this review are organized by academic degree program and are arranged alphabetically. In Table 1 there are four columns of data displaying Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) for each program. From left to right, these columns show program performance in the following areas: 1.) **Enrollment**: Fall 2012/2013 headcount by program and the **Enrollment Trend**: Percent increase or decrease in enrollment from Fall 2011/2012 to fall 2012/2013; 2.) **Persistence Rate***: Percent of students who were enrolled in a first level course in 2011/2012 and continued into a second level course in 2012/2013; 3.) **Graduation rate***: The number of degrees awarded in each program during the 2011/2012 academic year.

Benchmarks for three KPIs*, Enrollment Trend*, P*ersistence Rate*, and G*raduation Rate*, were established by the Student Learning Team for the 2011/2012 academic year.

> 2011/2012 Benchmarks and the Criterion Standard for each Benchmark:
> Enrollment Trend: Less than 25% decline from fall to fall.
> Persistence Rate: 55% or higher retention from Level I to Level II.
> Graduation Rate: 8 or more graduates per year

Table 1, *Program Review Summary of Key Performance Indicators*

Academic Programs	Key Performance Indicators			
	Enrollment		Persistence	Graduation
	Fall 2012/2013 Headcount	Enrollment Trend Fall to Fall Headcount Percent change	1st level course to 2nd level course	Degrees awarded 7/1/2011-6/30/2012
Associate of Arts	46	0.0%	NA	4
Associate of Science	371	-24.3%	NA	4
Business Programs				
Accounting	39	-11.4%	52.6%	15
Business Administration and Leadership	81	11.0%	60.0%	14
Business Management: Small Business Administration and Entrepreneurship	33	-10.8%	60.0%	8
Office Administration	30	-23.1%	71.4%	2
Real Estate	11	57.1%	57.1%	0
Building Preservation and Restoration	18	-55.0%	37.5%	6
Computer and Information Technology Programs				
Computer Science	38	-20.8%	69.2%	4
Cyber Security & Computer Forensics	22	-40.5%	76.9%	8
Interactive Media	19	-26.9%	50.0%	9
Library Paraprofessional - Information Services	19	-9.5%	63.6%	2
Microcomputer applications	2	-60.0%	0.0%	5
Network Administration	31	10.7%	61.5%	4
Programming	12	9.1%	0.0%	2
Engineering Programs				
Civil Engineering	43	2.4%	50.0%	11
Industrial Electronics	70	-32.7%	80.0%	24
Public Service Programs				
Criminal Justice	54	-29.9%	53.3%	22
Emergency Medical Services - Paramedic	20	-9.1%	13.3%	2
Firefighter	43	2.4%	33.3%	1
Industrial Technology Programs				
Industrial Trades - Heating, Ventilation, Air Conditioning	28	-47.2%	48.0%	6
Industrial Trades - Welding Technology	41	-30.5%	58.6%	9
Mental Health				
Child Development	48	-21.3%	54.1%	11
Mental Health Technology	73	-24.0%	46%	14
Medical				
Medical Assisting	105	-16.7%	100%	31
Radiologic Technology	29	-46.3%	NA	6
Nursing				
Practical Nursing	50	-36.7%	64.3%	51
Registered Nursing	158	1.9%	49.4%	59

Data Highlights

1. Ten of the programs did not meet the enrollment benchmark. Programs that experienced declines greater than 25% included: Building Preservation and Restoration (-55%), Cyber Security and Computer Forensics (-40.5%), Interactive Media (-26.9%), Microcomputer Applications (-60%), Industrial Electronics (-32.7%), Criminal Justice (-29.9%), Industrial Trades, HVAC (-47.2%), Industrial Trades, Welding (-30.5%), Radiologic Technology (-46.3%), and Practical Nursing (-36.7%).
2. The persistence benchmark was met by 11 programs where first and second level courses occur in different and subsequent academic years. Because the course sequences in the AA and AS degree programs are not as structured and prescribed, data on this metric are not reported for these programs. Similarly, in Radiologic Technology, Practical Nursing and Registered Nursing, first and second level courses are not taken in students' first and second academic years and the programs are not assessed on this benchmark.
Fourteen of the degree programs did not achieve the "8 or more graduates per year" benchmark

Conclusions and Targets for Improvement

Further analysis of the last five years of program review data shows that programs have met the performance metrics with regard to the KPI's in the aggregate approximately 66% of the time. Certain programs persistently have not met benchmarks or have inconsistently met the benchmarks. Over these years this has been reported to the Board annually. It has also been reported that specific programs not meeting the benchmarks have been placed on action plans for improvement. In the past the following programs have been discontinued due to persistently not meeting the benchmarks and not responding to action plans: Tooling and Machine; Industrial Electronics (Mechanical); Industrial Electronics (Telecommunications).

This year, as a result of programs placed on action plans continuing to fall short of reaching their benchmarks in Program Review, the following interventions were implemented:

1. Information Technology – All sub-majors in this program area were consolidated into two new associate of applied science degrees, The Networking Associate of Applied Science Degree and the Electronic Media Associate of Applied Science Degree. Both of these modified degree proposals were submitted to the Ohio Board of Regents on February 28, 2013 and were approved on March 13, 2013 and April 5, 2013 respectively. Both programs include internships and the development of student portfolios across the curriculum. They embed general and basic education core curriculum requirements that are totally transferable. In the Networking Degree, students are prepared to take several Cisco and Microsoft exams for networking application certifications. In the Electronic Media area, there are additional new media platforms and social media communications curriculum added in addition to the traditional media and programming content.

2. Early Childhood Development Associate of Applied Science Degree – A modified program proposal was submitted to and approved by the Ohio Board of Regents on February 1, 2013. The program is now eligible for the Department of Education licensure approval for pre-K certification and licensure. The students will be able to take the praxis exam upon graduation when it is approved. The program is also eligible for NAEYC accreditation.

The college will move forward this year for both licensure approval and national accreditation of the program.

3. Office Administration Management Associate of Applied Science Degree and Office Clerk Specialist Certificate – These programs were totally modified from their current structure utilizing the DACUM process in which business/industry and employers were brought to the college for one-half day. Focus groups were then utilized to tease out curriculum gaps and needed workforce skill sets and position descriptions. Subsequently, curriculum maps were formulated which were synthesized into new programs that better fit workforce needs. The new program proposals were submitted to the Ohio Board of Regents on February 20, 2013 and were approved shortly thereafter. Students will have expertise in various software capabilities with the ability to sit for Microsoft certification exams. Skill sets in document creation, proofing, editing, managing people, attention to detail, communication skills, and basic accounting are embedded in the curriculum. Students will have the opportunity to have experiential learning through internships and will be creating portfolios across the curriculum. All general and basic education requirements are transferable.

4. Associate of Applied Business in Business Management - Real Estate – This degree was removed from the Building, Preservation and Restoration (BPR) Program area where it stood as an associate of applied science degree with many BPR classes embedded in the curriculum. It is now housed in the Business program area where it is classified as an associate of applied business degree and meets all of the Department of Commerce requirements for the Real Estate Broker's licensure exam. A new course, Human Resource Management, provides knowledge about the evolution of modern day human resources and the management and supervision of employees. This new degree proposal was submitted to the Ohio Board of Regents on February 18, 2013 and was approved on February 28, 2013. Portfolio and internships are embedded in the curriculum.

5. Proposals were sent to the Ohio Board of Regents between February 12 and February 18, 2013 re-creating the Accounting, Business Administration and Leadership, and Small Business Administration and Entrepreneurship Associate Degree Programs, and the Bookkeeping Certificate. Input from the Business community, Advisory Committees, and the graduates was used to create new curriculum in these program areas. It was concluded that the programs are relevant, but the curriculum needed to be updated, consolidated, streamlined and made transferable. A number of new courses were developed such as Project Management, Organizational Behavior, Fundamentals of Tax Accounting, and Small Business Management. All programs include internships, capstone courses, student portfolios, and a solid general education and basic core of transferable courses.
The new Marketing Degree, a collaborative between Business Management and Information Technology, also resulted from this initiative and was approved by the Ohio Board of Regents. This new concentration adds marketing theory and technology to business skills which enable graduates to assist businesses to create strong relationships with customers. Introduction to Marketing, Web Marketing, Introduction to New Media, Multimedia and Design and Development are new courses that provide students with the ability to create and understand how new social platforms are used in marketing and how to develop concepts to deliver product value through messaging. Portfolios and internships are embedded across the curriculum.

6. The number of credit hours in all of the programs was decreased, thus expediting time-to-degree and eliminating redundant content and student cost. Course scheduling will be more flexible as well. Approval of all proposals was received in time for fall 2013 implementation.

7. Modified programs will be expected to consistently meet benchmarks within two or three years. Programs currently on action plans that continually fall short of benchmarks will be modified or deactivated according to the new Program Review Model (see last recommendation).

8. The following 2+2 agreements have been finalized with Kent State University:

    a. Associate of Arts – Bachelor of Business Administration; Accounting;
    b. Associate of Arts – Bachelor of Business Administration; Business Management;
    c. Associate of Applied Science, Civil Engineering – Bachelor of Science Degree in Engineering Technology, Manufacturing/Mechanical/Systems Concentration;
    d. Associate of Applied Science, Civil Engineering – Bachelor of Science Degree in Engineering Technology, 2+2 Integrated Engineering Technology Concentration;
    e. Associate of Applied Science Degree, Industrial Electronics – Bachelor of Science Degree in Engineering Technology, Electrical/Electronics;
    f. Associate of Applied Science Degree, Industrial Electronics – Bachelor of Science Degree in Engineering technology, Green and Alternative Energy.

9. Continuing activities for ongoing program review and development include the following:

    a. In an ongoing fashion continue to develop 2+2 transfer and articulation agreements with Ohio University, Ohio State University, Youngstown State University, and the University of Akron. Contacts have been made with all of these institutions. We have two draft agreements with Ohio University for a Bachelor of Business Administration Degree and a Bachelor of Accounting Degree. We are currently drafting several agreements with Youngstown State University in the area of Business Management. Extend 2+2 agreements across other disciplines besides Business and Engineering.
    b. Continue to establish feasibility for the following new programs by fall 2013: Chemical Operator, Health Information Technology, Instrumentation Certificate, and Addictions Counselor.
    c. Pursue NLNAC accreditation for the Associate Degree Nursing Program.
    d. Collaborate with the Department of Strategic Communication and Enrollment Services to develop recruitment and communication plans for the new program initiatives by May 2013.
    e. Develop the Admissions and Advising Model to include metrics for tracking and augmenting student retention by May 2013.
    f. Collaborate with Program Chairs to revise the Program Review Model to include more precise decision-making metrics. Train faculty in the use of the revised model.